Excerpt from November 23, 2000 legal opinion for the Islands Trust Re: Policy Statement Directive Policies from Bill Buholzer (formerly Lidstone, Young, Anderson)

(3 paragraphs released to public by Executive Committee on October 19, 2010)

Directive Policies

The thrust of the changes that are proposed to the "directive policies" is to change requirements that local trust committees and island municipalities "address" certain matters in their plans and regulatory bylaws, to a requirement that they include those matters in their regulatory bylaws. Presumably the intent here is to provide more definite policy direction to the local trust committees.

In principle, we see no reason that the more mandatory language cannot be adopted in the Islands Trust Policy Statement. Indeed, it could be argued that the proposed language of the directive policies is more consistent with the Islands Trust Act than the current, more neutral language. The scheme of the Islands Trust Act is that the Islands Trust Policy Statement forms a substantive policy context for local bylaws. The Islands Trust Act certainly supports a requirement that local trust committees not only address certain subjects in their plans and bylaws, but that they address those matters in a specific way or to a specific effect. Inherent in the choice of wording for policies of this nature, is a choice as to how much leeway the Trust Council wishes to leave to local trust committees in implementing the Islands Trust Policy Statement and, indirectly, the object of the Islands Trust. That is a matter on which we think that a court would defer to the judgment of the Trust Council, should any party, including any local trust committee, challenge the authority of the Trust Council to constrain the bylaw making powers of local trust committees in this manner.

As for the authority of the Trust Council to enforce the adherence of local trust committees to directive policies, the Islands Trust Act provides a very simple bylaw approval procedure permitting the executive council or the Trust Council, as the case may be, to determine whether a particular bylaw is contrary to or at variance with the trust policy statement. There is no question that the Trust Council and the executive committee have the authority to refuse to approve a bylaw if, in its reasonable opinion, the bylaw does not comply with a "directive policy" in the trust policy statement.